

MINUTES OF THE SYDNEY EAST REGION JOINT REGIONAL PLANNING PANEL MEETING HELD AT ASHFIELD COUNCIL ON WEDNESDAY, 17 AUGUST 2011 AT 5.30PM

PRESENT:

John Roseth	Chair
David Furlong	Panel Member
Mary-Lynne Taylor	Panel Member
Ted Cassidy	Panel Member
Lyall Kennedy	Panel Member

IN ATTENDANCE

Atalay Bass	Ashfield Council
-------------	------------------

APOLOGY: NIL

1. The meeting commenced at 5.34pm.

2. Declarations of Interest -

Nil

3. Business Items

ITEM 1 - 2011SYE054 Ashfield 10.2011.066 - Works to existing heritage items to create 8 units; demolition and construction of a part 4 and part 5 storey development comprising 70 dwellings over; 46 - 56 Liverpool Road, Summer Hill

4. Public Submission -

David Rollinson, on behalf of Ashfield and District Historical Society	Addressed the panel against the item
Kit Bashford, on behalf of the owners corporate of SP16130	Addressed the panel against the item
Lindsay Fletcher, Town Planner	Addressed the panel on behalf of the applicant
Professor Peter Webber, Urban Design	Addressed the panel on behalf of the applicant
Robert Stass, Heritage Adviser	Addressed the panel on behalf of the applicant
Erin Owen, Architect	Addressed the panel on behalf of the applicant

5. Business Item Recommendations

ITEM 1 - 2011SYE054 Ashfield 10.2011.066 - Works to existing heritage items to create 8 units; demolition and construction of a part 4 and part 5 storey

development comprising 70 dwellings over; 46 - 56 Liverpool Road, Summer Hill

- 1) The Panel resolves by a majority of 4 to 1 (for: John Roseth, Mary Lynne Taylor, David Furlong and Lyall Kennedy; against: Ted Cassidy) that it would grant consent to the application subject to
 - a) a suitable set of conditions to be prepared by the council's planning assessment officer;
 - b) the applicant submitting amendments along the lines indicated on detail plan level 03 August 11;
 - c) the applicant submitting amendments that respond to the 3 points made by the council's Heritage Advisor, Robert Moore in his memo of 16 March 2011; and
 - d) lowering the building at the apartment on the south-eastern corner of Building B by a level.
- 2) Councillor Cassidy voted against approval for the following reasons:
 - a) the proposal is partly outside the development zone indicated on the Site Compatibility Certificate (SCC) and therefore not consistent with the SCC; and
 - b) The proposal should be 2-3 storeys high in order to be compatible with the surrounding area; however, it is 4-5 storeys high.
- 3) The majority of the Panel voted for approval for the following reasons:
 - a) while the proposal is partly outside the development zone indicated in the SCC, the relationship of Building B to Carleton House is satisfactory;
 - b) the council's Heritage Consultant, in his memo of 16 March 2011, indicated satisfaction with the relationship of the new buildings to Carleton House;
 - c) the council's consultant on SEPP 65 assessment, in his memo of 15 June 2011, indicated satisfaction with the proposal;
 - d) three-quarters of the site is landscaped;
 - e) in the Panel's opinion the proposal is well designed; and
 - f) the majority of the Panel placed major weight on the preservation of Carleton House.
- 4) The Panel requests:
 - a) the applicant to prepare amended drawings responding to paragraph 1 by 2 September 2011;
 - b) the council's planning assessment officer to prepare appropriate conditions of consent by 16 September 2011;
 - c) the council's planning assessment officer to advise whether the amended proposal responds to the requirements in paragraph 1; and
 - d) the applicant to respond to the draft conditions by 23 September 2011.
- 5) Following the above, the Panel will determine the application by communicating by electronic means.

6. Business Items

ITEM 2 -2011SYE055 Ashfield 10.2011.067 - Works to existing club premises, construction of a 7 level building comprising a new function centre, 135 room hotel and retail premises over multi-level; 113 - 115 Liverpool Road, Ashfield

7. Public Submission -

Kerry Barlow	Addressed the panel against the item
Bob Maddison	Addressed the panel on behalf of the applicant
Lance Doyle	Addressed the panel on behalf of the applicant
Michael Morgan	Addressed the panel on behalf of the applicant
Josh Hollis	Addressed the panel on behalf of the applicant

8. Business Item Recommendations

ITEM 2 - 2011SYE055 Ashfield 10.2011.067 - Works to existing club premises, construction of a 7 level building comprising a new function centre, 135 room hotel and retail premises over multi-level; 113 - 115 Liverpool Road, Ashfield

1. The Panel resolves by a majority of 4 to 1 (for: John Roseth, Mary Lynne Taylor, David Furlong and Ted Cassidy; against Lyall Kennedy) that it would approve the application if another level of parking were provided and subject to the agreement of Railcorp.
2. The Panel requests the applicant to submit, on or before 2 September 2011, amended plans that include an additional level of parking. The Panel requests the council's planning assessment officer to report, as soon as possible after 2 September 2011, whether the additional level has been provided and whether Railcorp's agreement has been obtained. Following this the Panel will determine the application by communicating by electronic means.
3. Councillor Kennedy voted against approval because the setback to the western boundary is inconsistent with past resolutions of the elected council. In addition he does not accept that the parking provision is adequate even with an extra level of parking.

9. Business Items

ITEM 3 - 2011SYE056 Ashfield 10.2011.89 - The construction of a two (2) to six (6) storey residential flat building containing 62 dwellings above two levels of basement carparking and associated; 1 - 7 Victoria Street, Ashfield NSW 2131

10. Public Submission -

Adrian Tourle	Addressed the panel against the item
Michelle Spadaccini	Addressed the panel against the item
Bob Maddison	Addressed the panel on behalf of the applicant
Lance Doyle	Addressed the panel on behalf of the applicant
Michael Morgan	Addressed the panel on behalf of the applicant
Josh Hollis	Addressed the panel on behalf of the applicant

11. Business Item Recommendations

ITEM 3 - 2011SYE056 Ashfield 10.2011.89 - The construction of a two (2) to six (6) storey residential flat building containing 62 dwellings above two levels of basement carparking and associated; 1 - 7 Victoria Street, Ashfield NSW 2131

- 1) The Panel resolves unanimously to defer the application to allow the applicant to submit amended drawings on or before 16 September 2011. The amendments should include the following:
 - a) a minimum of 6m setback to the western and southern boundaries; 6m to 9m setback to the northern boundary (as per latest drawings), thus increasing deep soil planting around the building;
 - b) 25% of the site to be deep landscaping in accordance with the Residential Flat Design Code;
 - c) meet the requirements of the council's Heritage Advisor in relation to the Victoria Street elevation;
 - d) provide the required design justification for the basement car park;
 - e) maintain 10% accessible dwellings;

- f) finalise the stormwater drainage system to the council engineer's satisfaction.
- 2) The Panel requests the council's planning assessment officer to prepare a supplementary report on how the amended plans respond to the above requirements, as soon as possible after 16 September 2011. Following this the Panel will determine the application by communicating by electronic means.

The meeting concluded at 10.10pm.

Endorsed by

John Roseth
Chair, Sydney East
Joint Regional Planning Panel
17 August 2011